

GAP-AnArt-HasNa

Evaluation Study of the Effects of Micro Entrepreneurship Training

Kilis and Mardin – 2007

1. Aim of the Study

The basic aim of the study is to reveal the perceptions of trainees enrolled in the “Micro Entrepreneurship Training Program” offered by HasNa Inc. and AnArt in the cities Kilis and Mardin, on the program, the subjects they used and were affected by most, and to evaluate the program and offer suggestions for improvement.

2. Scope of the Study

The scope of the study includes the trainees enrolled in the training program offered in Kilis and Mardin (including Nusaybin). Nine trainees joined the training program from Kilis. Two of these trainees married and moved to Istanbul, and 1 married and moved to Van. Interviews with these trainees were not possible. Therefore, **the total number** of the participants in the interviews conducted in Kilis **is 6**. The interviews were conducted face to face with each participant separately.

The number of trainees enrolled in Mardin (Nusaybin) is 13. As one of the trainees married, one of them moved to Istanbul and one was ill, interviews could not be held with 3 of the trainees and the **total number** of participants interviewed in Mardin and Nusaybin **is 10**. Here the interviews were conducted face to face with each participant separately as well.

Location of Interviews:

Kilis-ÇATOM building, Mardin-ÇATOM building, Nusaybin-ÇATOM building

3. Findings

The questions previously prepared on the question sheet were addressed at the participants. The first 10 of the questions were Likert Scale type items, and involved questions aimed at measuring levels of satisfaction with the training program, whereas the other questions were open-ended items. The data obtained from the participants is presented in the form of weighted averages. The weighted averages are obtained by summing the total number of responses to an option and dividing them by the total number of participants.

1. What is the relationship with your current job and the training you received?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4= much	5=very much	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:1	Number of Marking Participants:3	4,75
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:1	Number of Marking Participants:4	4,80

Note: 1. As 2 of the participants in Kilis were out of work, this item was evaluated for 4 participants.

Note: 1. As 5 of the participants in Nusaybin were out of work, this item was evaluated for 5 participants.

2. How much new information did you learn in the training program?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=much	5=very much	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:3	Number of Marking Participants:3	4,50
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:5	Number of Marking Participants:5	4,50

3. How good/useful was the information you learned for you?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:2	Number of Marking Participants:4	4,67
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:2	Number of Marking Participants:8	4,80

4. Did the training focus on the subjects you wanted?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:3	Number of Marking Participants:3	4,50
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:4	Number of Marking Participants:6	4,60

5. Did the content of the raining program match the defined objectives?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:1	Number of Marking Participants:5	4,83
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:2	Number of Marking Participants:8	4,80

6. How much did you benefit in general from the program?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:1	Number of Marking Participants:5	4,83
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:2	Number of Marking Participants:8	4,80

7. How did you find the organization and use of the materials used in the training program?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:2	Number of Marking Participants:2	4,67
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:5	Number of Marking Participants:5	4,50

8. Was the teaching of the instructor effective?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis					Number of Marking Participants:5	5,00
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:3	Number of Marking Participants:7	4,70

9. How effective was the methodology used by the trainer?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis				Number of Marking Participants:1	Number of Marking Participants:5	4,83
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:2	Number of Marking Participants:8	4,80

10. How were the preparation and preparation style of the trainer?

Locations	1=not at all	2=very little	3=some	4=good/useful	5=very good/very useful	Weighted average
Kilis					Number of Marking Participants:6	5,00
Mardin and Nusaybin				Number of Marking Participants:3	Number of Marking Participants:7	4,70

LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE EVALUATION OF THE LIKERT SCALE TYPE

ITEMS:

Although some differences are observed between the levels of education of the participants, their evaluations are very similar. This situation is a criterion that indicates that in general the training program was perceived to be productive and successful. As seen above, the values attributed by the participants to the questions are high, the lowest value being **4,50** out of 5, which shows a high level of satisfaction.

The participants expressed their satisfaction especially with the topics being useful and up-to-date, the trainer's performance, the teaching style, and the flow of topics. It is interesting to note here that **none of the participants receiving training opened/attempted to open their own business** after completion of the training. The presently business owning participants are individuals who also worked before they received training. In Kilis, 5 of the 6 participants still continue their activities at ÇATOM (as trainer, hairdresser, and weaver). The participants rated the first item 4.50, i.e., they feel they benefit from the training at present and expect to continue benefitting from it.

The participants state that they found the training style participative, practice oriented and comprehensible and reflected this in their evaluations by rating the items with the highest values, showing their satisfaction.

Despite all this, it is observed that the education level of the participants affects their perception of the training program in general. It is observed that university graduates learned more from the program. This difference is reflected in the type of businesses they want to establish as well. Whereas the university graduates and to some extent high school graduates mention they want to involve in more human relations oriented, innovative, outward businesses (such as cafeteria, textile, tourism, textile industry, public relations), the primary school graduates prefer to involve more in small scale businesses aimed at fewer customers (sewing, home weaving).

Certainly, the enrollment of and the extent to which the participants benefit from the training program as well as the business they intend to venture are affected by their social environment, their parents' and/or spouse's level of education and profession, and their siblings.

PARTICIPANTS' RESPONSES TO THE OPEN-ENDED ITEMS-EVALUATIONS

Question: Which of the training topics did you learn the most easily?

Responses-views;

- ✓ Procedures involved in establishing a business
- ✓ The fundamental principles of entrepreneurship
- ✓ The fundamental principles of trade
- ✓ Profit-loss accounting, income-expenditure accounting
- ✓ Depreciation accounting
- ✓ Principles of dealing
- ✓ Job security
- ✓ Communication skills
- ✓ Bookkeeping-accounting
- ✓ Conflict solving

Question: Which of the training topics did you like most?

Responses-views;

- ✓ The game/application on trading/dealing
- ✓ Methods of investment
- ✓ Profit-loss accounting
- ✓ Financial management
- ✓ Market analysis
- ✓ Problem analysis-conflict resolution
- ✓ Human relations-communication
- ✓ Use of credit/loans
- ✓ Listening-comprehension

It needs to be pointed out here that while the participants in Kilis mentioned trade, methods of investment, profit-loss accounting more frequently, the participants in Mardin and Nusaybin mentioned topics such as human problem analysis, conflict resolution, listening-comprehension more. It can be concluded that the topics embraced may depend on the socio-cultural conditions of the region and the means possessed.

Question: Would you recommend this training program to others? If so, to whom, and why?

Responses-views;

All participants answered yes to this question. They stated that this training should be offered to all individuals who want to become entrepreneurs, who want to invest their savings, and that they recommend this training be offered to men as well. The reason they expressed for their recommending the program is that with this training, entrepreneurship may be facilitated, will be based on principles and may result in more effective use of resources. The view that men should be offered this training as well was persistently emphasized. It was revealed that after the training the participants' spouses, fathers did not understand accounting issues, and that they did not trade according to the principles.

While recommending the training program to others, among their reasons they mentioned features of the program that could contribute to effective communication, problem solving in daily life, individuals' ease of developing business, and conflict resolution.

Question: What other training could we offer you?

Responses-views; (in order of ?)

- ✓ Marketing techniques
- ✓ Market research
- ✓ Problem analysis-problem solving techniques

- ✓ Customer relations- customer persuasion methods
- ✓ Communication techniques, skills
- ✓ Capacity building
- ✓ Business opening procedures
- ✓ Social security/insurance applications
- ✓ Labor rights
- ✓ Tailoring-model design
- ✓ Child care- child development
- ✓ Establishing a business, business development
- ✓ Elderly care

Question: What are your views/suggestions related to the training program?

The views expressed on the training program were that it was positive, useful, and it went well. In addition, the following suggestions and other views can be listed as follows:

- ✓ After completion of the training program, a visit to a successful business in the city where the training takes place or another city, should be organized in order to witness how learned procedures take place in practice.
- ✓ Excursions could be organized to observe developments and trends/fashion in professional subjects (e.g. hairdressing, weaving, textile, tourism, and giftware) and fairs could be visited. In this manner, product diversification and changes in customer demands could be followed.
- ✓ Some topics could be simplified (e.g. cost accounting). Comprehension of this topic may vary with the participants' level of education.
- ✓ The duration of the program should be longer and more opportunities for practice should be given.

- ✓ If participants have the same level of education, the program can be more fruitful.
- ✓ The room where the training takes place should be comfortable and spacious.
- ✓ The syllabus of the training program should be distributed to the participants in advance.
- ✓ More attention could be given to the topic “entrepreneurship”.
- ✓ The training should be repeated every three years.

EVALUATOR’S GENERAL OBSERVATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

1. The training program was very successful and all of the participants expressed their satisfaction.
2. In Kilis, the participants sometimes exchange views with each other. Five of the 6 interviewed participants currently work at ÇATOM. However, they make no attempt of starting a joint venture. The participants in Mardin and Nusaybin reported to have had almost no contact with each other after completion of the raining program.
3. Participants gained self-confidence after the training and have become closer followers of the developments in their field.
4. Some of the participants wanted to establish a business but could not due to lack of capital. Hence, including informative activities on topics such as methods for obtaining credit, credit sources, and bank loans into the training program is of importance.
5. Participants recurrently reported that other friends also wanted to enroll in the training program.
6. After the training, one of the participants in Kilis took up handcrafting, attended some fairs and became productive. With exception of this participant, no participant

found a new job, or changed jobs, which is due to the capital factor and the employment opportunities in the city.

7. The trainers established good interaction with the participants and this contributed to the success of the program.
8. The material distributed during the training and the applied examples have deeply impressed the participants.
9. Participants have stated that these trainings should be supported with micro-credits. In fact, participants are satisfied with the training, but cannot put into practice what they have learned as they lack the capital/resources to become entrepreneurs. Therefore, the GAP Directorate, in cooperation with national and international organizations such as the Halk Bank, KOSGEB (Small and Medium Enterprises Development Organization) the EU, UNDP, and the World Bank, needs to investigate micro-credit sources for women.
10. After completion of the training program, one to one contact should be established with women who plan to start a business and they should be assisted in the process. The GAP Directorate should increase its support at local level.
11. Participants tend to prefer individual business ventures, which is due to an apprehension of a joint venture. Upon finding capital/resources, participants should also be educated on starting joint ventures, being joint partners and organizational structure and ways to start joint ventures should be sought. To illustrate, small textile and/or weaving workshops to be operated by 4-5 women could be established.
12. The training the participants receive should definitely be made concrete through excursions to successful businesses. Thus, participants should visit a successful enterprise/business on-site.

13. The space where training takes place is of considerable importance. There should be ample space in the room and the room should lend itself to group activities.
14. It is important that the training programs coincide with the times that the participants have less work to do. Participants mentioned January-February-March as the most convenient period to attend training programs.
15. During the training program in Kilis, a modelist at ÇATOM was conducting another training program and therefore, individuals who actually should attend the program could not. Two simultaneous training programs reduced the success of the training program a little.
16. Daily evaluation of the training may increase the success of the program.
17. During the selection of participants, criteria such as level of education, family background, and marital status should be taken into consideration.
18. As the participants pointed out, there is a demand for training on issues such as marketing techniques, market research, problem analysis-solution techniques, customer relations-persuasion methods, communication techniques-skills, capacity building, business opening procedures, social security/insurance applications, childcare, child development, elderly care, and labor rights.
19. After the training program, women in Kilis requested a place from the local government to exhibit and sell their products. However, as the women did not consider it be in a good location they did not accept the place offered.
20. Especially in Kilis, the women working at ÇATOM (in fact they appear among the permanent staff of the People Education Center) experience social security problems. The women are only allowed to pay the social security premium for 2 or 3 months of work per year, which renders it impossible for these women to ever retire. Measures

to be taken by the GAP Directorate to solve this issue will increase the women's motivation.

21. During the training, the fact that all trainees come from different cities needs to be considered, as level of education, life style and individual relations that result from this may also affect the way trainees participate in the training.
22. Almost none of the jobless trainees are registered at the Employment Agency of Turkey. Providing direction in this line to the trainees may help them in finding employment and use their unemployment rights.
23. Providing trainees with education on issues such as civil rights, women's movement and associations, and creating awareness will add to the strength of the training program.

Finally, training programs have a deep impact on trainees. This impact needs to be studied in terms of economic effects and socio-cultural effects separately, because observing the former and deriving implications for practice is difficult. For this to be possible, the trainee should have employment, involve in individual or joint business, and possess economic resources, all of which depend on regional and national conditions and priorities.

The socio-cultural impact of the training program can be observed more clearly and concretely as trainees' daily life relationships with their family and immediate surroundings, the way they deal with problems and suggest solutions are more observable elements.

Hence, practical training on topics such as awareness raising, problem analysis, conflict resolution, childcare, child development, and social relationships is as important as training on starting a business and entrepreneurship.

Dr. Bulent GULCUBUK

Appendix: Stories

Ayşe ORUK-Sibel ORUK: Mardin

These twin sisters work in the same supermarket, Ayşe as cashier and Sibel in the glassware department. They report that after the training their relations with customers and their employer developed. Both also attended a painting course. With their self-confidence developed in the training they want to start a hairdresser salon, however, they do not possess the means. They want to receive training on finding resources, credit providing institutions, etc. They have three other sisters and one brother.

Yüksel HOCAOĞLU: Mardin

She is a middle school graduate and married to a journalist. She is currently homemaker. Previously she had a ravioli shop employing 7 people, for which she obtained financial resources through mediation of the GAP-GİDEMs. This business lasted for 2 years after which disagreement with her business partner resulted in separation and she shut down the business. She has not been able to find a new female business partner to start a new business. Moreover, she has lost courage. She states that the most important problem in the region is the lack of qualified personnel. She mentions that social environment may negatively affect entrepreneurs. Social activities are limited in the region and therefore women cannot gather. She points out that content should be included in the training program to strengthen the women's movement.

Hayriye BAKIŞ: Mardin

She is a tailor who stopped work 7 months ago. She is a widow with four children. Her father, who is municipal police officer, supported her in her previous enterprise. She wants to start a new business but she lacks the financial means and there is no one to support her.



Kilis-CATOM



Kilis-CATOM



Kilis-CATOM



Nusaybin-CATOM



Nusaybin-CATOM